

## Right to Life, a Divine Right or a Human Right?

*Mirsaeid Musavi Karimi\**

DOI: 10.22096/HR.2023.1971570.1520

[Received Date: 29/10/2022 - Accepted Date: 31/05/2023]

### Abstract

Undoubtedly, the right to life is the most important of all rights. Regarding this point, the fundamental question is, who has the authority to make laws and take action resulting in humans being killed? In response to this question, in this paper, I aim to defend the thesis that only God has the (moral/legal/religious) authority to make and issue the laws surrounding life and death. So, it is rational to believe that the right to life is restrictively a Divine right and not a human right. The paper is organized as follows: after introducing some elementary points and definitions, two arguments in favor of the above thesis will be formulated. In the first argument, by laying out some thought experiments, it is shown that human laws concerning civilians' life are paradoxical and implausible. The second argument is based on exploring the origin of the right to life. In the last part of the paper, some implications and advantages of the favored thesis will be stated in brief.

### Key Words:

Right to Life; Divine; Human; Antinomy; Utilitarianism; Consequentialism; Virtue Ethics.

---

\* Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.  
Email: msmkarimi@mofidu.ac.ir



## Bibliography

- Alexander, Larry and Michael Moore. "Deontological Ethics", in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (winter 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta, 2021. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2021/entries/ethics-deontological/>
- al-Shaykh al-Saduq, Muhammad ibn 'Ali. *Man lā Yahḍuruḥu al-Faqīh*. vol. 4, A.A. Ghaffari (ed.). Qom: Daftar Entesharat Islami, 1413 AH. [In Persian]
- Aristotle. *Nicomachean Ethics*, in: *The Complete Works of Aristotle*, Vol. 2, Edited by Jonathan Barnes, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Athanassoulis, Nafsika. "Virtue Ethics", in *the Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (2022): Available at: <https://iep.utm.edu/virtue/>
- Bentham, Jeremy. *The Works of Jeremy Bentham*, Vol. 2, Original from the New York Public Library, 2009. Available at: [https://books.google.com/books?id=QF5GAAAAYAAJ&source=gbs\\_similarbooks](https://books.google.com/books?id=QF5GAAAAYAAJ&source=gbs_similarbooks)
- Birsch, Douglas & John H. Fielder. *The Ford Pinto Case: A Study in Applied Ethics, Business, and Technology*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1994.
- Bojnourdi, Seyyed Mohammad. *Ghava 'ed Fegh 'hiyyeh*. vol. 1, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Tehran: Orooj, 1401 AH. [In Persian]
- Douven, Igor. "Abduction", in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Summer 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta, 2021. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/abduction/>
- Driver, Julia. "The History of Utilitarianism", in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (winter 2014 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2014/entries/utilitarianism-history/>
- Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari, M. M. *An Analysis of Epistemological Justification of Inference to the Best Explanation*, Ph.D. Thesis, M. Mousavi Karimi and E. Azadegan (supervisors). Tehran: Sharif University of Technology, 2016. [In Persian]
- Griffin, James. *Well-Being: Its Meaning, Measurement, and Moral Importance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989.
- Grotius, Hugo. *The Rights of War and Peace: book I*, Edited and with an Introduction by: Richard Tuck. Liberty Fund, 2005 [1625].
- Gunkel, David J. *Robot Rights*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press, 2018.

- Harris, Jamie, and Jacy Reese Anthis. "The Moral Consideration of Artificial Entities: A Literature Review", *Springer Link*, 2021. Available at: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11948-021-00331-8>
- Harris, N.G.E. "Hart on Natural Rights", *British Journal of Political Science* 2, Issue 1 (January 1972): 125–127.
- Hart, H. L. A. "Are there any natural rights?", *Philosophical Review* 2, no. 64 (1955):175-191.
- Herzog, Don. *Without Foundations: Justification in Political Theory*. Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Hurka, Thomas. *Virtue, Vice, and Value*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Hursthouse, Rosalind, and Glen Pettigrove. "Virtue Ethics", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (winter 2018 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta, available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2018/entries/ethics-virtue/>.
- Jackson, Frank, and Michael Smith. "The Implementation Problem for Deontology", in *Weighing Reasons*, edited by Errol Lord & Barry Maguire. Oxford: OUP (2016): 279–292.
- Josephson, John R., and Josephson, Susan G. (Eds.) *Abductive Inference: Computation, Philosophy, Technology*. Cambridge: CUP, 2003.
- Kamm, F. *Intricate Ethics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Kant, Immanuel. *Critique of Pure Reason*, Translated By Norman Kemp Smith (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.). Hampshire: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003[1787].
- Kant, Immanuel. *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*. Translated by James W Ellington. (3rd edition). Indianapolis: Hackett Pub. Co, 1993[1785].
- Kant, Immanuel. *The Metaphysical Elements of Justice: Part I of the Metaphysics of Morals*, translated by: J. Ladd. Indianapolis: Hackett Pub. Co, 1965[1780].
- Kawall, Jason. "In Defence of the Primacy of Virtues", *Journal of Ethics and Social Philosophy* 2, no. 3 (2009): 1–21.
- Levy, David. *Robots Unlimited: Life in a Virtual Age*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press, 2005.
- Locke, John. *Second Treatise of Government and a Letter Concerning Toleration*. Edited by Mark Goldie. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Mack, Eric. "Hart on Natural and Contractual Rights", *Philosophical Studies: An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition* 29, no. 4 (Apr. 1976): 283-285.
- Mack, Eric. "Natural and Contractual Rights", *Ethics* 87, no. 2 (Jan. 1977): 153-159.

- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. E'temad Al-Islami Bakhtiari. "Deficiency of Probabilistic Approach for Settling Voltaire's Objection", *Methodology of Social Science and Humanities* (MSSH) 25, Issue 98 (Spring 2019): 139-150. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "An Analysis of Probabilistic Criteria in Inference to the Best Explanation", *Logical Studies*, Article 2, Vol. 8, Issue 2 - Serial Number 16 (Summer and Autumn 2017): 25-48. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "Inference to the Best Explanation and "the Bad Lot Objection"." *Hasti va Shenakht (Journal of Existence and Knowledge)* 2, Issue 2 - Serial Number 4 (Autumn & Winter 2015): 111-130. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "The Relation between Explanatory Virtues and the Limitation of Hungerford's Objection", *Zehn (Mind)* 16, Issue 63 (Autumn 2015): 131-164. [In Persian]
- Müller, Vincent C. "Ethics of Artificial Intelligence and Robotics", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (summer 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/ethics-ai/>
- Nagel, Thomas. *Concealment and Exposure*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Nickel, James. "Human Rights", in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2021/entries/rights-human>.
- Nozick, Robert. *Anarchy, State and Utopia*. New York: Basic Books, 2013[1974].
- Sandel, Michael J. *Justice: What's the Right Thing to Do?*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2009.
- Schupbach, Jonah.N. "Is the Bad Lot Objection Just Misguided?", *Erkenntnis* 79, (2014): 55-64.
- Sheliazhenko, Yurii. "Artificial Personal Autonomy and Concept of Robot Rights", *European Journal of Law and Political Sciences* (2017): 17-21.
- Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter. "Consequentialism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta, 2021. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2021/entries/consequentialism>.
- Slote, Michael. "The problem we all have with deontology", in: *Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics*, edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (2011): 260 – 270.
- Smart, J. J. C., and Bernard Williams. *Utilitarianism: For and Against*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

Soha. *Naghd-e Quran*. 1393, available at:

<https://mamnoe.files.wordpress.com/2014/09/naghde-quran.pdf> [In Persian]

Tabataba'i, Muhammad Husayn. *Al-Mizan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an*. vol. 2. Beirut: al-Alami lel-Matbu'at, 1417 AH. [In Persian]

Thomson, Judith Jarvis. "The Trolley Problem", in *Deontology*, edited by Stephen Darwall Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing (2003): 139-162.

Valentini, Laura. "There are no natural rights", (2017): Available at:

[https://www.law.nyu.edu/sites/default/files/upload\\_documents/Valentini%20NYU%20Rights.pdf](https://www.law.nyu.edu/sites/default/files/upload_documents/Valentini%20NYU%20Rights.pdf)

Van Fraassen, B.C. *Laws and Symmetry*. New York: OUP, 1989.

Von Braun, Joachim et al. (Ed.) *Robotics, AI, and Humanity: Science, Ethics, and Policy*, Springer Link, 2021. Available At:

[https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-54173-6\\_16](https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-54173-6_16)

Watson, Gary "On the Primacy of Character", edited by Owen Flanagan and Amlie Oksenberg Rorty, *Identity, Character, and Morality: Essays in Moral Psychology*. Cambridge: MIT Press (1997): 449-69.

Wenar, Leif. "Rights", in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (spring 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta, available at: