

The Consistency Dilemma of Right, Duty, and Responsibility: A Comparative Study of Applying the Rule to the Right to Self- Determination

*Ahmad Deylami**

DOI: 10.22096/HR.2023.1998738.1569

[Received Date: 19/03/2023 - Accepted Date: 01/09/2023]

Abstract

One of the hallmarks of a favorable normative system is the building/existence of congruence among symmetrical rights, duties, and responsibilities. The right of self-determination is a fundamental human right in various legal and ethical domains. This paper is focused on establishing compatibility between this fundamental right and its subsequent duty and responsibility. Man has the natural and social mechanisms to determine his own destiny. Is it appropriate to give him the right of self-determination in the moral and legal laws, which may cause him to ruin himself and others? Is it unreasonable for righteous rulers to determine human beings' fate to improve their well-being? On the other hand, considering their fallibility, is it not possible that they become dictators who may ruin themselves and others? Then, can humans be held responsible for their own destruction? This paper aims to answer these questions in a descriptive, analytical, and critical manner. The answer implies a compatible system of thought, mainly based on the distinction between the moral and legal aspects of the three aforementioned concepts.

Keywords: Duty; Responsibility; Right to Self-Determination; Structural Justice; Value.

*Associate prof, faculty of law, University of Qom, Qom, Iran.
Email: a-deylami@qom.ac.ir



Bibliography

- The (Holy) Qur'an*, Translated by Ezatolah Fouladvand, Qom: Osveh, 1998.
- Asghari Aghmashhadi Fakhreddin, and Farnaz Shirani. "Self Determination on the International Instrument and Quran," *Islamic Human Right Researches* 2, no. 2 (Spring 2013): 99-122. [In Persian] <http://www.pfbaj.ir/browse?Action=issue>.
- Austin, John. *Lectures on Jurisprudence, or the Philosophy of Positive Law*. Two vols, edited by R. Campbell. 4th edition, rev. London: John Murray; reprint Bristol: Thoemmes Press, 2002.
- Bahr al-Ulum, Seyed Muhammad. *Bolghat al-Faqih*, Tehran: Maktab al-Sadiq, 1983. [In Arabic]
- Beheshti, seyed Mohamad, *Freedom, Anarchy, Force*, Tehran: Boqah, 2002. [In Persian]
- Beheshti, seyed Mohamad, *Theoretical Foundation of Constitution (Iranian)*, Tehran: Boqah, 2011. [In Persian]
- Blackham, Herold John, *Six Existentialist Thinkers*, translated by Mohsen Hakimi, Tehran: Markaz, 1997. [In Persian]
- Burke A., Hendrix. *Ownership, Authority, and Self-Determination*. Pennsylvania: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Campbell, Garnett. "Responsibility and self-determination." *The Journal of Philosophy* 47, no. 18 (Aug 1950): 526-530.
- Copleston, Frederick, *A History of Philosophy*, Translated by Amir J. A'lam, Tehran: Soroush Press, 1991. [In Persian]
- Dierkes hans, *Philosophische Anthropologie*, Translated by Mohammad Reza Beheshti, Tehran: Hermes, 2010. [In Persian]
- Emami Masood. "The rational validity of the majority Vote based on the right to self-determination," *Fiqh* 19, no. 2 (summer 2012): 104-129. [In Persian] https://jf.isca.ac.ir/article_3008.html.
- Fichte, Johann Gottlibeh, *Grundlage Des Naturrechts*, Translated by Seyed Masood Hoseini, Tehran: Qoqnoos, 2019. [In Persian]
- Frankena, William K. *Ethics*, Translated by Hadi Sadeqi, Qom: Taha, 1997. [In Persian]
- Ghari seyed fatemeh, Seyed Mohammad, *Human Right*, Tehran: Shahid Beheshti University, 2002. [In Persian]

- Hakim, Seyed Mohammad Taghi, *Nahj Al-Ffeghaha*, Qom: 22 Bahman Publication, 1999. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Manzour, Mohammad, *Lesan Al-arab*, Beirut: Dar Al-Ihya, 1988. [In Arabic]
- Iravani, Ali, *Margin of Ketab al-makaseb*, Qom: Sobh Al-sadegh, 2004. [In Arabic]
- Isfahānī, Mohammad Hussein. *Margins of the book Al-Makasib*, Qom: Knowledge base, 2004. [In Arabic]
- Isfahānī, Ragheb, *Al-mofradat*, Damascus: Dar Al-hadi, 1990. [In Arabic]
- Javid Mohamad javad, and Mohamad Mahdi khosravi. "Critical Analytical Analysis of Theoretical Foundations of Legal Positivism and Its Effects on Legal Justice," *Public Law Studies Quarterly* 49, no.3 (October 2019): 735-755. [In Persian] <https://doi.org/10.22059/jplsq.2018.242144.1587>.
- Kant, Immanuel, *Die Metaphysiche Der Sitten*, Translated by Manouchehr Sanei Darrehbidy, Tehran: Nagsh-o Negar Publishers, 2009. [In Persian]
- Kant, Immanuel, *Eine Vorlesung Über Ethik*, Translated by Manouchehr Sanei Darrehbidy, Tehran: Nagsh-o Negar Publishers, 2009. [In Persian]
- Kant, Immanuel, *Metaphysiche Anfangsgrunde der Tugenlehre*, Translated by Manouchehr Sanei Darrehbidy, Tehran: Nagsh-o Negar Publishers, 2009. [In Persian]
- Katuzian, Naser, *Civil Liability*, Tehran: Tehran University Press, 2008. [In Persian]
- Khoi, Seyed Abolghasem, *Msbah Al-feghha*, Dar Al-hadi, 1990. [In Arabic]
- Ma'mouri, Ali, *Political Theory of Shahid Sadr*, Qom: Qom University Press, 1998. [In Persian]
- Mehrpour Hosein. "Self Determination on Viewpoint of Islam." *The Scientific Journal of Strategy* 10, no.2 (Summer 2002): 123-135. [In Persian] http://rahbord.csr.ir/article_123895.html.
- MesbahYazdi, Mohammad Taghi, *Questions and Answers*, Qom: Imam Khomeini Educational and Research Institution, 2012. [In Persian]
- Montazeri, Hosein Ali, *Derasaton fi Velayat Al-Faqih VA Fiqh Al-Doulah Al-Islamiyah*, Qom: Internal Center for Islamic Researches, 1986. [In Arabic]
- Mousavi Khomeini, Seyed Rouhollah, *Ketab al-Beia'*, Qom: Esmailian, 1999. [In Persian]

- Mousavi Khomeini, Seyed Rouhollah, *Sahifah Al-Noor*, Tehran: Imam Khomeini Publication, 2000. [In Persian]
- Naini, Mohammad Hosein, *Ketab al- bieia VA Al-makaseb*, Qom: Islamic Publication Institution, 2000. [In Arabic]
- Naini, Mohammad Hosein, *Monyato al-ttaleb*, Qom: Islamic Publication Institution, 2002. [In Arabic]
- Naini, Mohammad Hosein, *Tanbih Al-ommah VA Tanzih Al-mellah*, Qom: Ahsan al-hadth, 1998. [In Arabic]
- Omidi Ali. "The Conceptual Evolution of the Right of Self-Determination in International Law," *International Law Review* 23, no. 25 (January 2006): 225-250. [In Persian] [HTTP://DEX.DOI.ORG.10.22066/CILAMAG.2006.17827](http://DEX.DOI.ORG.10.22066/CILAMAG.2006.17827).
- Philpott, Daniel. "Defense of Self-determination." *Ethics* 105, no. 2 (Jan 1995): 352- 385.
- Pink, Thomas. *Self-Determination; the Ethics of Action*. Volume 1. U.S.A: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Rachels, James, *The Elements of Moral Philosophy*, translated by Arash Akhgari, Tehran: Hekmat Publication, 2010. [In Persian]
- Rahmatolahi Husain, and Ehsan Aqamohmadaqai. "An Introduction on the Role of State in Particibility of People," *Journal of Legal Studies* 5, no.3 (March 2014):67-107. [In Persian] <http://dex.doi.org.10.22099/JLS.2014.1912>.
- Rainer, forst. "Nominal Alienation: Rousseau, Kant and Marx on the Dialectics of Self-Determination." *Kantian Review* 22, no. 4 (2017): 523–551.
- Rasekh, Mohammad, *Right and Maslahat*, Vol 2, Tehran: Nashre Ney, 2016. [In Persian]
- Sadr, Seyed Mohammad Bagher, *Courses on Elm Al-Usul*, Beirut: Dar Al-Ketab Lebanon, 2000. [In Arabic]
- Seung-Kee Lee, Madison. "Self-Determination and the Categories of Freedom in Kant's Moral Philosophy." *Kant-Studien* 103 (Walter de Gruyter 2012): 337–350. DOI 10.1515/kant-2012-0022.
- Sharif al-Razi, Seyed Mohammad, *Nahj Al-Balāghah*, Tehran: Scientific and Cultural Publication, 1999. [In Arabic]
- ṬabaṬabaī Yazdi, Seyed Mohammad Kazem, *Margin of Ketab al-makaseb*, Qom: Dar al-Mastafa, 2001. [In Arabic]

- ṬabaṬabaĪ, Mohammad Hosein, *Al-Mizan*, Qom, Islamic Publication Institution, 1995. [In Arabic]
- Vara'ee Seyyed Javad. "Imam Khomeini and the right to fulfill destiny," *Transcendent Policy* 1. 2, issue 4 (June 2013): 43-60. [In Persian] https://sm.psas.ir/article_20007.html?lang=en.
- Verneaux, Roger and Jean Wahl, *Phenimnologie and Philosophie de l'existence*, translated by Yahya Mahdavi, Tehran: Kharazmi, 1993. [In Persian]
- Wesley, Hohfeld. "Some fundamental legal conceptions as applied in judicial reasoning." *Yale Law journal* 23, Issue 1(1913): 16- 59.